

Appendix

Formal decision making

The following provides a snapshot of activity in the past 18 months, based upon the current Leader's Scheme of Delegation and an indication of decisions taken in different portfolio areas and the amount of business that might need to be accommodated in a future committee structure.

Number of Cabinet and Individual Cabinet Member (ICM) decisions taken from May 2018 to 15 November 2019:-

Cabinet Portfolio	ICM	Cabinet	Total (ICM + Cabinet)
Leader	8	1	9
Transport and Development	38	22	60
Finance (inc. Resources and Governance)	9	62	71
Environment and Streetscene	7	5	12
Culture, Parks and Leisure	5	17	22
Education and Skills	4	14	18
Children and Families	3	33	36
Health and Social Care	6	27	33
Neighbourhoods and Community Safety	10	14	24
Business and Investment	1	6	7
Total	91	201	292

Number of Officer Non Key Decisions (May 2018 to 15 November 2019) – 111

Volume of Meetings

There were 42 formal meetings held in the Municipal Year 2018/19 across the Cabinet and 5 Scrutiny Cttees (see below).

Actual meetings held in 2018/19 under the current model – Cabinet (monthly) & Scrutiny Cttees (bi-monthly)

Cabinet	12 meetings
Overview and Scrutiny Management Cttee	5 meetings
Children, Young People & Family Support Scrutiny Cttee	7 meetings
Economic & Environmental Wellbeing Scrutiny Cttee	5 meetings
Healthier Communities & Adult Social Care Scrutiny Cttee	7 meetings
Safer & Stronger Communities Scrutiny Cttee	6 meetings
Total =	42 meetings

Meetings and decisions - What do we publish now?

Meetings

- Council side and Executive meetings - Committee agendas, reports, decision records and minutes, other information including attendance and declarations of interest
- Council (in addition to above) - Motions, Amendments, Members' Questions and Membership reports
- Calendar of meetings
- Council, Cabinet and Scrutiny Committee meetings are webcast and these can be viewed live or at a later date.

Plans

- Forward Plans of forthcoming executive decisions

Decisions

- Decision register and decision records, reports and summaries for individual key and non-key decisions taken by the Leader, Cabinet Members, Executive Directors and officers, including non-key officer decisions

E-Petitions portal and lists of petitions received and action taken

Other supporting documents, including

- Constitution
- Leaders Scheme of Delegation
- Portfolio Schemes of Delegation
- Memberships
- Directors' responsibilities
- Monthly minute book

Cost of meetings

There may be financial implications of changing to a different form of governance. The costs of a committee system will depend on the number of committees and the level of support required for a different structure. The estimated cost of democratic services support per meeting is set out, as follows:

Activity	Estimated hours	Cost (hourly rate £50 p/hour) £
Lead-in/coordination/preparation/publication etc -	8	400
meeting time	3	150
Post meeting work hours	8	400
Total (hours/cost)	19	950
30% (overhead)		285
Total cost per meeting (including 30%)		1,235

Members' Allowances

- Details of the allowances paid under the current 2019/20 Members' Allowances Scheme is set out below.
- A review of the Members' Allowances Scheme would be required for a new governance model, including consideration by the Independent Remuneration Panel. The recommendations of the Panel would then be considered by Council as part of its decision making on a new Members' Allowances Scheme.
- Members' roles and responsibilities would need to be defined and an assessment made of the value which might be attached to the respective roles within the decision making structure.

Current Members' Allowances Scheme 2019/20

<u>Post (& number of Members)</u>	<u>Amount of Allowance</u>	<u>Total Amount Paid</u>
- Basic Allowance (84)	£12,339.01	£1,036,476.84
- Leader	£19,090.68	£19,090.68
- Deputy Leader	£ 9,545.35	£ 9,545.35
- Cabinet Members (8, in addition to Leader and Deputy)	£ 9,545.35	£76,362.80
- Lead Member for Scrutiny (and Chair of O&S Management Committee and a Scrutiny Committee)	£ 7,890.82	£ 7,890.82
- Chairs of Scrutiny and Policy Development Committees (3)	£ 7,890.82	£23,672.46
- Leader of Opposition Groups with more than 20% of the membership of the Council (1)	£ 7,890.82	£ 7,890.82
- Chair of Planning and Highways Committee (2 Joint Chairs)	£ 5,536.30	£11,072.60
- Chair of Licensing Committee (2 Joint Chairs)	£ 5,536.30	£11,072.60
- Local Area Partnership Chairs (7)	£ 5,536.30	£38,754.10
- Opposition Group Office Holders (2)	£ 5,536.30	£11,072.60
• with more than 40% membership of the Council (3)		
• with more than 30% membership of the Council (2)		
• with more than 20% membership of the Council (1)		
- Cabinet Advisers (10)	£ 4,359.04	£43,590.40
- Deputy Chair of Licensing Committee (0)	£ 3,181.78	-
- South Yorkshire Pensions Authority - Member (5)	£ 3,557.20	£17,786.00
- Chair (0)	£11,777.38	-
- V/Chair (0)	£ 5,888.69	-

Political Proportionality under a Committee System

- Composition of the Council in 2019/20 is –

Labour:	$49 \div 84 \times 100 =$	58.34%
Liberal Democrat:	$26 \div 84 \times 100 =$	30.95%
Greens:	$8 \div 84 \times 100 =$	9.52%
Other (Cllr Clarkson):	$1 \div 84 \times 100 =$	1.19%
- Based on this composition, any committee established with 6 or more seats provides representation for all 3 political groups.
- Council Procedure Rule 25.4 specifies that every Member of the Council, except those appointed to the Cabinet, shall be appointed a member of at least one Scrutiny and Policy Development Committee or one Regulatory Committee.
- Using this principal under the committee system would mean ensuring a minimum of 84 seats across the main committees (i.e. Planning & Highways Cttee, Licensing Cttee, a single Scrutiny Cttee?, a Policy Cttee?, other Cttees to be established).
- Planning & Highways Cttee has been established with 13 seats, and Licensing Cttee has been established with 15 seats, a total of 28 seats. Retaining these Cttees and their sizes, would leave a further requirement of 56 seats.
- Establishing a single Scrutiny Cttee (to undertake the residual statutory scrutiny functions) with 13 seats would increase the total to 41 seats, leaving a further requirement of 43 seats.
- Establishing 3 further Cttees with 15 seats each would increase the total to 86 seats, just sufficient to cover the requirement to provide a seat for all 84 Members of the Council. This would be the minimum requirement in order to accommodate all 84 Members.
- Table 1 below illustrates how this minimum structure may work in practice. The 3 new Cttees, for example, could be based on the structure of the Council (People, Place & Resources).
- Another option (table 2 below) would be to establish 5 new Cttees (to replace the current Cabinet & Scrutiny Cttees) based on the remit of the current Scrutiny Cttees, i.e. (1) Children, Young People & Family Support, (2) Economic & Environmental Wellbeing, (3) Healthier Communities & Adult Social Care, (4) Safer & Stronger Communities and (5) Finance & Resources (as replacement for the Overview & Scrutiny Management Cttee).

- Table 3 below illustrates a structure of 10 new Committees (to replace the current Cabinet & Scrutiny Cttees) based on the current portfolios of the Cabinet Members (with a Policy & Scrutiny Cttee as replacement for the Leader’s portfolio).
- Table 4 below illustrates a structure with one decision making Committee and one Scrutiny Committee (to replace the current Cabinet & Scrutiny Cttees).

Table 1 - Illustrative Example of Proportional Seat Allocations to Political Groups based on the 2019/20 composition and the minimum Committee Structure of 3 Committees

Committee	Labour	Lib Dem	Green	Other	Total
People Services Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Place Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Resources Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Scrutiny Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Planning and Highways Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Licensing Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Sub-total seats on main Cttees (no. of Members of Group)	52 (49)	28 (26)	6 (8)	0 (1)	
Audit & Standards Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Admissions Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Senior Officer Employment Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Appeals and Collective Disputes Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Total Initial Allocation	78	42	10	0	130
Overall Political Balance Requirement	76	40	12	2	130
Adjustments Required	-2	-2	+2	+2	

Total of 130 seats (86 of which are seats on “main” Cttees i.e. a surplus of 2 seats in relation to accommodating all 84 Members)

Labour $130 \times 58.34\% = 75.84$ (75) +1 = 76

Liberal Democrat	130 x 30.95% = 40.23	(40)		= 40
Greens	130 x 9.52% = 12.38	(12)		= 12
Other	130 x 1.19% = 1.55	(1)	+1	= 2
		(128)		(130)

4 adjustments required (1 seat from 4 different Committees) – a minimum of 3 seats required from a “main” cttee.

Table 2 - Illustrative Example of Proportional Seat Allocations to Political Groups based on the 2019/20 composition and a Committee System of 5 Committees

Committee	Labour	Lib Dem	Green	Other	Total
Children, Young People & Family Support Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Economic & Environmental Wellbeing Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Healthier Communities & Adult Social Care Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Safer & Stronger Communities Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Finance & Resources Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Planning and Highways Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Licensing Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Sub-total seats on main Cttees (no. of Members of Group)	57 (49)	29 (26)	7 (8)	0 (1)	
Audit & Standards Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Admissions Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Senior Officer Employment Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Appeals and Collective Disputes Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Total Initial Allocation	83	43	11	0	137
Overall Political Balance Requirement	80	42	13	2	137
Adjustments Required	-3	-1	+2	+2	

Total of 137 seats (93 of which are seats on “main” Cttees i.e. a surplus of 9 seats in relation to accommodating all 84 Members)

Labour	137 x 58.34% = 79.93	(79)	+1	= 80
--------	----------------------	------	----	------

Liberal Democrat	137 x 30.95% = 42.40	(42)		= 42
Greens	137 x 9.52% = 13.04	(13)		= 13
Other	137 x 1.19% = 1.63	(1)	+1	= 2
		(135)		(137)

4 adjustments required (1 seat from 4 different Committees) – a minimum of 2 seats required from a “main” cttee.

Table 3 - Illustrative Example of Proportional Seat Allocations to Political Groups based on the 2019/20 composition and a Committee System with 10 Committees

Committee	Labour	Lib Dem	Green	Other	Total
Policy & Scrutiny Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Business & Investment Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Children & Families Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Culture, Parks & Leis Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Education & Skills Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Env., Streetscene & CC Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Finance, Res & Gov Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Health & Social Care Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
N/Hoods & C/Safety Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Transport & Dev't Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Planning and Highways Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Licensing Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Sub-total seats on main Cttees (no. of Members of Group)	57 (49)	29 (26)	12 (8)	0 (1)	
Audit & Standards Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Admissions Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Senior Officer Emp Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Appeals and C/Disputes Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Total Initial Allocation	83	43	16	0	142
Overall Political Balance Requirement	83	44	13	2	142
Adjustments Required	0	+1	-3	+2	

Total of 142 seats (98 of which are seats on “main” Cttees)

Labour	142 x 58.34%	=	82.84	(82)	+1	= 83
Liberal Democrat	142 x 30.95%	=	43.95	(43)	+1	= 44
Greens	142 x 9.52%	=	13.52	(13)		= 13
Other	142 x 1.19%	=	1.69	(1)	+1	= 2
				(139)		(142)

3 adjustments required (1 seat from 3 different Committees) – a minimum of 1 seat required from a “main” cttee.

Table 4 - Illustrative Example of Proportional Seat Allocations to Political Groups based on the 2019/20 composition and a Committee System with 1 Committee and 1 Scrutiny Committee

Committee	Labour	Lib Dem	Green	Other	Total
1 Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
1 Scrutiny Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Planning and Highways Cttee	8	4	1	0	13
Licensing Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Sub-total seats on main Cttees (no. of Members of Group)	35 (49)	19 (26)	4 (8)	0 (1)	
Audit & Standards Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Admissions Cttee	4	2	1	0	7
Senior Officer Employment Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Appeals and Collective Disputes Cttee	9	5	1	0	15
Total Initial Allocation	61	33	8	0	102
Overall Political Balance Requirement	59	32	10	1	102
Adjustments Required	-2	-1	+2	+1	

Total of 102 seats.

Labour	102 x 58.34%	=	59.51	(59)		= 59
Liberal Democrat	102 x 30.95%	=	31.57	(31)	+1	= 32
Greens	102 x 9.52%	=	9.71	(9)	+1	= 10
Other	102 x 1.19%	=	1.21	(1)		= 1

(100)

(102)

3 adjustments required (1 seat from 3 different Committees). The total of 102 seats (split 59 : 32 : 10 : 1) provides sufficient seats for all Members of each Group (49 : 26 : 8 : 1).

However, there are only 58 seats on the four "main" Cttees – i.e. a shortfall of 26 seats in order to accommodate all 84 Members. In order to accommodate all 84 Members, these four Cttees would need to be established with a minimum of 21 seats. The initial allocation would be 12.25 / 6.5 / 2 / 0.25 – meaning one committee split 13 : 6 : 2 : 0 , two split 12 : 7 : 2 : 0, and one split 12 : 6 : 2 : 1.